Human Trafficking in Jharkhand: An Analysis of Newspapers Coverage and Communication Approaches in Mitigating Modern Day Slavery

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for award of the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Mr. Saket Kumar Bhardwaj

Registration No.: TZ167103 of 2016



Department of Mass Communication and Journalism School of Humanities and Social Sciences Tezpur University, Napaam Tezpur- 784028

Assam, India December, 2022

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The study is concluded in this chapter, along with the summary of critical findings mentioned in the previous chapter. The study aimed to comprehend the prevalence of human trafficking in Jharkhand while attempting to analyze media coverage and communication efforts to stop modern day slavery. The chapter also discusses the study's limitations and future directions before offering recommendations.

7.1 Conclusion

There is mounting evidence that human trafficking, contemporary slavery, is on the rise (Abraham, 1987). The worst type of human trafficking is the exploitation of girls and women for sexual purposes in exchange for forced or inexpensive labour. Since human trafficking is influenced by various causes, frequently acting in concern with one another, it is argued that there is no simple or one-dimensional solution to the problem.

The study took the same multidimensional approach to investigating human trafficking in Jharkhand. The study employed mixed-method approach to get a detailed and multifaceted view of human trafficking in Jharkhand. It has used national and international reports and government documents to get secondary data on human trafficking. At the same time, in-depth interviews of experts and rescued victims were conducted to gain first-hand experience of the situation. The study also used content analysis and surveys to evaluate media coverage and determine the level of awareness in Khunti, one of the most prone districts in terms of human trafficking in Jharkhand.

The study was based on three broader objectives to analyze the issue in detail. To investigate the prevalence of human trafficking in Jharkhand, the study tended to assess the status and interpret the purpose and possible factors of human trafficking in Jharkhand. Data and numbers published and recorded in government documents and reports sought that Jharkhand has become a hunting ground. With thousands of tribal women and children being transported out of the state each year to Delhi, Punjab, Haryana, and other places. Jharkhand has become a center for human Trafficking in India. From Jharkhand, an estimated 33,000 girls have been trafficked annually. At the same time, in-depth interviews reveal that the primary purposes behind human

trafficking from Jharkhand include domestic servitude, forced labour, and bride trafficking. The study revealed poverty, conflict, weak family structure, and low awareness as the primary factors of human trafficking in the state.

Secondly, the study tried to evaluate coverage of human trafficking in two prominent newspapers of Jharkhand. In evaluating media coverage, the study examined the frames and coverage given to human trafficking by daily newspapers. The study found that news coverage predominantly gave a crime frame to human trafficking instead of human rights frame and presented dominant views in their coverage, adding to concern regarding the social responsibility of the press.

Finally, the study tried to see communication responses in mitigating human trafficking and also analyze the level of awareness among the selected sample population in the Khunti district of Jharkhand. A study employing a Social-Ecological Model to explore intervention at several risk levels found that at the individual level, the government has no such policy intervention to curb human trafficking. Awareness level in the Khunti district of Jharkhand also raises the question of government efforts.

The study concludes that control measures alone cannot halt the flow of trafficking and that a strategy based entirely on one kind of approach would be too limited. Punitive actions must be balanced with preserving human rights, tighter law enforcement, and eliminating the primary reasons for irregular movement for a plan to be effective. It is necessary for the origin, transit, and receiving levels to cooperate and agree on measures.

7.2 Limitations of the Study

It takes time and effort to conduct research. Each research study has its limitations and adds to the body of knowledge already in existence. Similar restrictions apply to this investigation. The study's ability to analyze and interpret qualitative data acquired through in-depth interviews with experts and rescued victims may be constrained by the researcher's prior experience, which is one of the typical constraints of social science research.

Only quantitative analysis of the coverage of human trafficking in newspapers is a methodological limitation of the study because the qualitative evaluation of newspaper articles and quantitative content analysis would have given a detailed context of media coverage. The study also evaluated the communication approach adopted by the government. The detailed semiotic analysis of posters, pamphlets, and government advertisements about the awareness of human trafficking could have given a methodological boost to this study.

The study also has ethical limitations. Because of legal issues, it took a long time to identify and extract the data and conduct interviews with the victims and rescuees. Reporting government documents and victims involves legal and ethical challenges, which further limits the scope of the study.

The study has operational constraints too. The time frame in which the research was anticipated to be finished is also a significant constraint. The research was expected to take two years, but collecting data from government and non-government organizations was laborious and time-consuming. Getting government employees, media personnel and experts working on the ground to talk about human trafficking was not an easy task. The lack of adequate literature on communication perspectives to fight human trafficking is also an operational limitation. Due to the current inflationary tendencies, transportation issues, and risk associated with travelling to different trafficking prone areas for essential information and materials, finances were significant. The study area was Jharkhand, a state with a recognized population of tribal people. The language was also a considerable constraint in interactions with indigenous people because human trafficking is a severe problem among them as well.

7.3 Future Scope of the Study

According to Kolko (2012), human trafficking is a complex, complicated, criminal, tragic, and evil human problem that calls for interdisciplinary solutions to be understood, diminished, and eventually eradicated. This section lists the numerous areas this study doesn't cover in depth.

This thesis shows explicitly that although the field of communication has not yet conducted a thorough investigation into the role of communication in human trafficking, communication does play an essential role in (1) preventing human trafficking, (2)

fostering public opposition to human trafficking, and (3) the rescue and rehabilitation of trafficked people.

Given the illegal and covert nature of human trafficking, this thesis serves as a model for future communication studies on the subject insofar as it draws attention to the ethical and legal limitations of investigating the practice as well as the extensive precautions that have been taken and still need to be taken to manage numerous associated risks.

Jharkhand has been the primary focus area of the study, and future research can cover the whole of India, as human trafficking is a problem in several other Indian states. Seeing the global nature of human trafficking, future research can draw a critical comparison citing efforts and interventions to control human trafficking in other countries.

For analyzing media coverage of human trafficking, this study focussed on newspaper articles only. Future research can evaluate the content related to human trafficking in other media forms like television, films, documentaries, digital media, etc. There can also be a scope to compare frames and coverage of human trafficking by international news organizations to Indian media.

This study has employed conflict theory, framing theory, and social-ecological model as its theoretical base. Several other communication theories can be an effective lens to analyze human trafficking effectively through a communication perspective in the future.

7.4 Recommendations

On the basis of the study's findings, the following recommendations were made; the documentation system needs to be enhanced. Case histories and follow-ups should be entered on time. The center coordinator should visit the local centers regularly to review the data to better monitor the documentation and coordination.

The study suggests building a trustworthy database. At the local and state levels, there are currently few quantitative statistics on the trafficking of women and children. The majority of the information is secondary data only. To accurately depict the scope of the issue, Jharkhand lacks a unique independent entity to establish such a database. Understanding the scope of the subject requires mapping susceptible regions in the districts and conducting surveys to identify vulnerable groups.

The report advises creating a specific information cell in the most vulnerable areas. Many trafficking victims and their families are unaware of the available legal and other support services. Information cells could be established at the village, mandal, and district levels to improve the availability of resources to those in need.

An immediate need exists for trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation will invariably be reduced by identifying susceptible individuals and mapping the hot places. Families in the BPL, those with low income and low self-esteem, and low-income families with girls in the marriageable age range are all vulnerable to falling into the hands of traffickers and middlemen. Using mapping to identify these families will assist governmental and non-governmental organizations in taking the necessary steps to lessen the vulnerability. Sharing knowledge about vulnerable populations and trafficking hotspots will significantly influence preventing trafficking.

For underprivileged populations in Jharkhand, the government should make educational investments and offer alternative economic options. By doing this, the number of people available for trafficking will be greatly decreased. With the aid of international organizations, nations should be urged to combat this crime at the national level first. Both at home and in the countries of destination, traffickers should face harsh punishment. Respecting the fundamental rights of trafficking victims requires taking into account their unique requirements and situation. The press should raise awareness about migration-related risks and monitor migration trends within and between countries.

To stop trafficking, viable livelihoods must be established in rural regions. It will assist the weaker population in overcoming vulnerable circumstances. Additionally, the beneficiaries should be identified appropriately and profited. Hence the PRI institute and village-level committees should monitor the various income production initiatives like MGNREGA, etc. Currently, the truth in desperate people frequently do not receive the necessary aid and are compelled to migrate for economic reasons in intolerable circumstances.

A fresh campaign emphasizing the value of the family, maintaining a good family reputation, and minimizing materialism should be launched. The media, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), UNICEF, the national and state agencies for prohibition and trafficking in persons, and religious organizations should all stand

together to denounce the cruel crime of human trafficking inside and outside of Jharkhand.

Because many families and children will rely on the media to inform and educate them about the dangers of child trafficking, the media should emphasize the battle against trafficking. Raising knowledge of the impact of child trafficking on children's health and education will lessen susceptibility to trafficking. Open discussion on safe migration and protection issues by civil society and media engagement can affect attitudes that support human trafficking.

The two chosen newspapers (Dainik Bhashkar and Prabhat Khabar) ought to have a specialized correspondent who would provide daily coverage of the adverse effects of human trafficking. The media should focus more on the risks of human trafficking in their editorials, features, stories about the general public, and news articles in their various newspapers.

To uncover all the hidden concerns that could help catch and punish those responsible for this human trafficking, the media should also engage in more excellent investigative reporting.

In today's concept of the "global village," it is expected that the media will take on the challenge of covering or reporting issues concerning victims, including the evils of human trafficking. The media should report what happens to trafficking victims in Africa, Asia, America, and other parts of the world.

Increased social knowledge of issues that may impact is necessary to reduce the prevalence of human trafficking. By altering the attitudes, convictions, and conditions that encourage trafficking, both on an individual and a community level, human trafficking can be prevented. A well-targeted media campaign or educational program has the ability to advance community awareness of abuse and trafficking issues significantly. This is done to recognize that the media greatly influences how people behave and think.

In addition to awareness campaigns, the Jharkhand government should prioritize outreach, particularly in schools, and targeting vulnerable individuals. Increased outreach innovations are required.

There is a need for community policing at the grassroots level that would allow the community members to maintain vigil at the community level. This could create a sense of involvement among the community members. The Anti-Human Trafficking Unit (AHTU) is a novel experiment in community policing. The network of NGOs and the Crime Investigation Department of Jharkhand police has created some AHTUs at the community level in the villages of Khunti district. These units comprise the PRI members, SHG members, Anganwadi workers, and Ngo representatives. These units act as a pressure group at the grass root level. There is a need for more units at the community level in trafficking-prone areas to control trafficking in humans.

By screening videos and documentaries on trafficking, sensitization programmes and awareness campaigns might be carried out at the village and mandal levels for the community's residents, SHG leaders, PRI members, etc. Additionally, they must be informed of the many anti-human laws against trafficking, victim services programmes, and current social security policies for trafficking victims. It would also be very beneficial to undertake issue-based consultation workshops and seminars for block-level administration officers, police officers, judicial officers, PRI members, SHG members, and officials from the women's and child welfare departments, among others.

An area-specific action plan should be created with a particular emphasis on prevention, raising awareness, community engagement, promoting sustainable livelihoods, and providing educational facilities and other essential services. Creating a region-specific action plan for trafficking prevention may require participation from various community stakeholders, including ward members, PRI members, village-level employees, women and child department officials, police officers, advocates, and NGO officials.