

DECLARATION

I, *Ms Ankita Chakravarty* from Department of Law, Tezpur University would like to declare that this dissertation titled “*Reservations to Human Rights: A Study on the Debate between Cultural Relativism and Universalism*” is my original work and has not been copied from any other source. Throughout the research, I have abided by the principles of academic integrity and honesty and have not misrepresented any facts, ideas, data for completion of the same. I further declare that any other source that has been used for ideas have been cited through references and been acknowledged. I would like to declare that this dissertation has not been and will not be submitted, either in part or in full for the award of any degree or diploma in any other institution.

Date:

Ankita Chakravarty

Place: Tezpur University

LAM21011



Department of Law

School of Humanities and Social Sciences

Tezpur University

Tezpur, Naapam 784028

Date: July 18th, 2020

CERTIFICATE

(BY SUPERVISOR)

The research work embodied in this dissertation titled, “Reservations to Human Rights: A Study on the Debate between Cultural Relativism and Universalism” which is being submitted by Ms Ankita Chakravarty has been carried out under my supervision and guidance. The same document has been subjected to plagiarism check with the aid of Turnitin software. This work that has been submitted for the award of the LL.M (Master of Laws) degree is original and has not been submitted elsewhere.

Date:

Signature of Supervisor

Place: Tezpur University

(Angel HabamonSyiem)

Assistant Professor



Department of Law

School of Humanities and Social Sciences

Tezpur University

Tezpur, Naapam 784028

CERTIFICATE

(BY HEAD OF DEPARTMENT)

The research work embodied in this dissertation titled, “Reservations to Human Rights: A Study on the Debate between Cultural Relativism and Universalism” which is being submitted by Ms Ankita Chakravarty has been carried out with my due permission and as allowed by Department of Law, Tezpur University. The same document has been subjected to plagiarism check with the aid of Turnitin software. This work that has been submitted for the award of the LL.M (Master of Laws) degree is original and has not been submitted elsewhere.

Date:

Signature of Head

Place: Tezpur University

(Dr. PriyaRanjan Kumar)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

A lot of effort from different people goes into completion of a research successfully. These are the unsung heroes without whom submission of this research work was not possible. I would like to extend my sincerest gratitude to everyone who was directly or indirectly involved in providing support, guidance and resources to fulfill my academic requirement of master's degree in law.

There are so many people I owe my gratitude to and beginning this with The Head of Department, Dr. Priya Ranjan Kumar who facilitated me to complete this research without any obstruction. I am deeply indebted to my supervisor, Ms Angel Habamon Syiem for constantly being by my side and assisting me in every possible way to make my work a worthy one. Mention must be made of the two incredibly helpful people, Dr. Madhumita Acharjee and Debajit Kumar Sharma for their valuable suggestions and guidance on research methodology.

I am grateful to the interviewees who happened to be academicians from different institutions who gave their valuable time to provide insights and knowledge to help my research present a learned perspective. I am forever indebted to my parents, my family who has been a constant source of motivation throughout my academic life. They had been supportive with all decisions I make and I want to thank them from the bottom of my heart.

Contents

ABSTRACT	ii
DECLARATION	iii
CERTIFICATE	iv
CERTIFICATE	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	vi
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	x
CHAPTER 1	1
INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Statement of Problem	4
1.3 Review of Literature	6
1.4 Significance of the Study	11
1.5 Research Objectives	12
1.6 Research Questions	12
1.7 Hypothesis	12
1.8 Research Methodology	13
1.9 Limitations of the Study	13
1.10 Chapterisation	14
CHAPTER 2	15
UNIVERSALISM: DEFENCES AND CRITICISMS	15
2.1 Human Rights and the UDHR	15
2.2 Universalism- A Jurisprudential Aspect	17
2.2.1 Historical or Cultural Universalism	17
2.2.2 Normative Universalism	20
2.2.3 Conceptual and Substantive Universality	22
2.2.4 Functional Universalism	23
2.2.5 International Legal Universalism	24
2.2.6 Overlapping Consensus Universalism	25
2.3 Human Rights- Development of the West?	26
2.4 The Ongoing Debate on Universalism	27
2.4.1 Criticisms on Universalism	27
2.4.2 Defences of Universalism	28

CHAPTER 3	31
JUSTIFICATION AND CRITIQUES ON CULTURAL RELATIVISM	31
3.1 Forms of Cultural Relativism.....	33
3.1.1 Agent Relativism and Appraiser Relativism	33
3.1.2 Descriptive, Metaethical and Normative Relativism.....	34
3.2 Two consequences of Relativism: Elitism and Conspiracy Theories of Human Rights.....	36
3.2.1 The Doctrine of Elitism	36
3.2.2 The Doctrine of Conspiracy	37
3.3 Arguments for and Against Cultural Relativism.....	38
3.3.1 The Triviality Argument.....	38
3.3.2 The Polygyny Argument	39
3.3.3 The Human Sacrifice Argument.....	40
3.3.4 The Nomad Argument	41
3.3.5 The Research Argument	42
3.3.6 The True-for-Them Argument.....	43
3.3.7 The Fallibilism Argument	44
3.3.8 The Empirical Outlook Argument.....	45
3.3.9 The Ethnocentrism Argument	46
3.3.11 The Tolerance Argument.....	48
CHAPTER 4	50
CULTURAL PROTECTION AND HUMAN RIGHTS: ANALYSIS OF PERSPECTIVES.....	50
PART I.....	51
HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATION IN THE NAME OF CULTURE.....	51
4.1 Using Culture as a Shield to not Abide by Human Rights.....	51
4.2 Culturally Protected Violations of Human Rights	52
4.2.1 Female Genital Mutilation or Female Circumcision	52
4.2.2 Polygamy	59
4.2.3 Sati in India.....	62
4.2.4 Holy Warriors from Algeria	64
PART II.....	70
ANALYSIS OF PERSPECTIVES	70
4.3 Human Rights: A Western Concept?	71

4.4 History of Respecting Women= Culture Aiding in Fulfillment of Human Rights?	73
4.5 Does the Dominant Oppress the Submissive in the Name of Culture?.....	76
4.6 Are Cultural Practices Gender Discriminatory?.....	78
4.7 Culture versus Human Rights	81
4.8 Go to Solution for the World: Cultural Relativism or Universalism	83
4.9 Is there a need for balance between the two Theories?.....	85
4.10 Suggestions for both the Theories to go hand in hand	86
CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSION	89
5.1 Findings	93
5.2 Suggestions.....	94
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	96
Appendix 1	101

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CAT	The Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman, or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1984.
CEDAW	The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, 1976.
CRC	The Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989
FGM	Female Genital Mutilation
ICCPR	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966.
ICESCR	The International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights, 1966.
ICERD	The International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965.
LDP	Liberal Democratic Party
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948.
UN	United Nations
WHO	World Health Organisation